

**PLANNING COMMISSION  
APPROVED MINUTES**

**TOWN OF ATHERTON  
October 23, 2013  
6:00pm  
COUNCIL CHAMBERS  
94 ASHFIELD ROAD**

**1. ROLL CALL**

**PRESENT: Herman Christensen Jr.  
Mary Beth Widmer  
Eric Lane  
Paul Tonelli  
Philip Lively**

Assistant City Attorney Jennifer Larsen and Deputy Town Planner Lisa Costa Sanders were present.

**2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

**MOTION to approve, as amended, the minutes of the September 25, 2013 meeting.  
M/S Lane/Widmer      Ayes: 5      Noes: 0**

**3. PUBLIC COMMENTS - none**

**4. COMMISSIONERS REPORTS –**

Commissioner Lively attended the Town Center Master Plan meetings and encouraged residents to call the Town to reserve a spot in one of the upcoming neighborhood meetings.

Chair Christensen gave an update on the heritage tree subcommittee and reported that the subcommittee is considering eliminating Monterey Pine and Eucalyptus trees from the Town's protected tree list. The subcommittee is also looking at how to regulate younger palms. They will look at the standards of care and landscape screening requirements. The next meeting of the subcommittee is Thursday, October 31, 2013.

**5. STAFF REPORTS - none**

**NEW BUSINESS**

**6. Selection of Planning Commission Chair and Vice-Chair**

**MOTION to appoint Herman Christensen as Chair of the Planning Commission.  
M/S Lively/Lane      Ayes: 5      Noes: 0**

**MOTION to appoint Philip Lively as Vice-Chair of the Planning Commission.  
M/S Christensen/Widmer      Ayes: 5      Noes: 0**

**7. Resolution Initiating an Amendment to Atherton Municipal Code Chapter 17.40, Athletic Court Regulations.**

Deputy Town Planner Lisa Costa Sanders presented the item.

The Commission would like staff to provide possible regulations for: BMX tracks, batting cages, dirt mounds from basements being used for recreational purposes as well as turning an empty pool into a skate park.

**MOTION to adopt a Resolution to initiate an amendment to Atherton Municipal Code 17.40 regulating athletic facilities.**

M/S Lane/Lively      Ayes: 5      Noes: 0

**PUBLIC HEARINGS**

**8. Draft Environmental Impact Report for the Cartan Field Improvement Project, Menlo School and Menlo College (APN070-250-190)**

Commissioner Widmer was recused due to her spouse holding a seat on the Town Council.

Chair Christensen introduced the item.

Deputy Town Planner Lisa Costa Sanders presented the item and noted the focus of the meeting is comments on the EIR.

Assistant City Attorney Jennifer Larson gave an overview of the scope of the meeting and the role of the Planning Commission and the speakers who choose to speak at the meeting.

Rebecca Gorton, Lamphier Gregory gave an overview of the CEQA requirements and of the findings of the Environmental Impact Report (EIR).

Commissioner Lane would like clarification of the noise density and loudness. He would like to see real data and not just the average. Additionally, Commissioner Lane would like to see data on the impact on those drivers turning right from El Camino Real in addition to the data on the left hand turn impacts.

Dave McAdoo, Director of Operations and Construction of Menlo School gave an overview of the projects. He outlined the outreach with neighbors and gave a basic outline of the size and location of the new facilities. He pointed out that the aquatic center will be 12 feet below grade with an eight foot acoustic wall surrounding the site. Additionally he pointed out that there will be a net to keep stray balls out of neighbors' yards. Mr. McAdoo noted that there will be no field lighting and there will be no night games.

Commissioner Lane expressed concern for birds hitting the net.

Commissioner Lively asked why the Commission is being presented with Concept C. Mr. McAdoo answered that they changed concepts based on the findings of the EIR.

OPEN PUBLIC COMMENT

John Braskamp, Isabella Avenue, commented that the project description is misleading. He noted that the proposal will double the noise threshold. He expressed concern about traffic and parking and the aquatic center having activities all year round. His final concern was that the only exit is near Isabella.

Rose Hau, Isabella Avenue, spoke in opposition to the project. She objects to the size and the scale of the project. She has concerns about the noise, traffic and aesthetics. Ms. Hau sees this as a Town issue and not a neighborhood issue. Alejandro and Selby Lane at El Camino are dangerous and she raised concern about the proposed driveway from the parking lot onto El Camino Real. Ms. Hau sees the density and appearance of the project as counter to the Town's General Plan. Additionally, Ms. Hau would like a clear sound analysis.

Anne McNertny, Watkins Avenue, suggested that the people on the east side of El Camino Real need to be taken into account. Ms. McNertny has concerns about the noise level. She finds the current noise level of activities at Cartan field to be annoying and is concerned about an increase in decibels and activity level.

Paul Getty, Isabella Avenue, requested continuous noise monitoring. Mr. Getty is concerned about the noise levels and is worried about density. He believes it will not look like Atherton. Additionally, Mr. Getty is worried about the removal of trees and would like more details about landscape screening. He would like to know where the netting and high fences will be. Mr. Getty asked if there will be artificial lighting and has concerns about light radiating. He has concerns about pedestrians on Alejandra. He would like clarification on historical Conditional Use Permits including the public address system and Sunday games.

Jeff Hiller, Brittany Meadows, expressed concern about the use and feels the project is not acceptable in a residential community.

Jay Hoag, Park Lane, commented that the EIR was well done and comprehensive. He feels the school has done a good job reaching out to neighbors. He added that the only new thing in the complex is the aquatic facility. He sees the positives in the major parking enhancement included in the project.

#### PUBLIC COMMENT CLOSED

Commissioner Lane would like more detail on the noise and traffic impacts.

Commissioner Tonelli would like more information on the project and sees the raised stands as projecting noise towards the neighbors.

Commissioner Lively would like to see more information on traffic on Valparaiso, Alejandra and El Camino Real. He feels the noise mitigation is insufficient. Commissioner Lively would like more information on the pool noise. He would like to understand the visual impacts of the two-story building. Commissioner Lively suggested that the netting is not addressed. He is not sure about the parking and feels attendance needs to be more clearly understood.

Commissioner Lane needs clarification about traffic on the site especially access to the pool.

Chair Christensen asked about the validity of the EIR since it was based on the old plan. Rebecca Gorton explained that the EIR actually endorses Concept C. Concept C is the environmentally superior Alternative.

Chair Christensen asked what happens if the Noise Ordinance amendment is not approved. Rebecca Gorton answered that the project would need to be reassessed. It is part of the proposal submitted by the applicant.

Chair Christensen asked if this would necessitate a new EIR. Deputy Town Planner Lisa Costa Sanders answered that a significant change to the project would require an amendment to the EIR and recirculation of the EIR.

Chair Christensen would like more detail on how the noise was measured and would like the east side of El Camino Real included in the study. Additionally, he asked how the noise limits will be enforced.

Chair Christensen raised his concern with spectators crossing Alejandro.

Commissioner Lively would like to see the decibel curve logarithm.

Annie Mudge, attorney for Menlo School and Menlo College spoke in support of the project and offered some clarifications on the questions raised.

There was a consensus among Commissioners to close the comments and to direct Lamphier-Gregory staff prepare response to comments.

Commissioner Widmer rejoined the meeting.

**9. Ordinance adding Atherton Municipal Code Chapter 17.58: Density Bonus and Other Concessions or Incentives**

Commissioners requested some maximum level be established in the regulations. There was consensus to continue the item for further study with restrictions appropriate to the Town.

Deputy Town Planner Lisa Costa Sanders presented the topic for discussion.

**MOTION to continue the item to the December 4, 2013 Planning Commission meeting.**

**M/S Lively/Widmer Ayes: 5 Noes: 0**

**10. Ordinance Amending Atherton Municipal Code Chapter 17.60, Accessory Building and Guest House Definitions**

Deputy Town Planner Lisa Costa Sanders presented the topic for discussion.

**MOTION that the Planning Commission recommend to the City Council to adopt the ordinance amending Atherton Municipal Code Section 17.60, Accessory Building and Guest House Definitions for the reasons incorporated in the staff report.**

**M/S Lively/Widmer Ayes: 5 Noes: 0**

**11. ADJOURN – The meeting adjourned at 8:05pm.**

Respectfully Submitted:

---

Lisa Costa Sanders, Deputy Town Planner